



Anthropology of Trauma, Memory and Commemoration

Dr. Carol Kidron
ckidron@soc.haifa.ac.il

The commemoration of the past plays a central role in the personal-private and public-collective work of culture. Traumatic memory has especially attracted attention in academic discourse as well as in everyday popular culture and mental health settings. Despite this growing interest, there have been few anthropological and ethnographic studies undertaken to explore the processes and practices of personal and collective trauma related memory work. In order to explore basic themes relating to the anthropology of memory, traumatic memory and commemoration, the course will examine the following key concepts: representation, history, genocidal trauma, personal and collective memory, testimony and witnessing, and survivorhood.

Holocaust memory and commemoration will be explored as a contemporary case study of Israeli trauma related memory work. The course will critically evaluate a variety of forms of Holocaust testimony, representation and commemoration and Holocaust trauma related therapy all of which sustain the presence of the past in everyday Israeli life. Cultural practices and sites of memory will be explored including: Holocaust memory in the private sphere, monumental Holocaust commemorative sites and ceremonies, cinematic representations of traumatic memory, and the politics of genocide in Israel. Expanding upon the case study of Holocaust memory, class discussion and student presentations will also examine war-related and terror-related traumatic memory work, bereavement and the politics of memory. The course will also expand upon the Holocaust case study by examining Holocaust memory and commemoration by comparatively exploring other case studies of global mass violence, trauma, and genocidal commemoration.

Course Requirements:

1. Empirical or non-empirical paper (Requirement for those who select this course for their empirical or non-empirical papers):

In an attempt to define the parameters of an Anthropology of Memory, Trauma and Commemoration **students who are required by the program to submit a short non-empirical paper or an empirical paper will be asked to write the former or latter papers for submission.**

Those writing a **non-empirical paper** will be asked to select a topic from the syllabus and to write an integrative thought piece approximately 10-12 pages long using 15 sources (at least 7 discussed in the course).

Those who are required to write an empirical paper will be asked to go out into the field of Israeli culture in order to seek out sites of memory and trauma related identities where the personal and/or collective traumatic past is made present and commemorated. Students will be asked to undertake interviews and/or participant observation at sites of memory and to write an empirical research paper (20-25 pages) that presents qualitative data and a sociological and or

anthropological analysis unpacking the processes and practices of memory work. Your analysis must utilize relevant academic literature appearing in the reading list below (at least 7 sources from the syllabus) and of course in the academic literature (an additional 8 sources) in the fields of anthropology, sociology, and Holocaust and Genocide Studies.

DEADLINE FOR EMPIRICAL PAPER – TBD

Students writing non-empirical or empirical papers will be asked to submit a 1-2 page proposal outlining their research topic, research site, tentative research questions and reading list (15 references). You may begin working on your research paper only after you receive my authorization of the proposal. Submission date for the proposal and final paper will be determined during the semester.

DEADLINE FOR NON-EMPIRICAL PAPER (REFERAT) – TBD

2. Requirement for all students – 5 Reading Reports

All students will be asked to submit 5 reading reports, one page long each, including a brief summary of the reading and a quote of your choice with an analysis of the quote. Reports must cover **required** readings and **be submitted prior to the lecture in which the topic will be discussed on the date listed in the syllabus for that topic.**

Deadlines for report submission – it is not possible to submit all 5 reports at the end of the course:

Report No. 1 submitted no later than: report submitted no later than: March 6

Report No. 2 submitted no later than: report submitted no later than: March 27

Report No. 3 submitted no later than: report submitted no later than: April 24

Report No. 4 submitted no later than: report submitted no later than: May 15

Report No. 5 submitted no later than: report submitted no later than: June 7

Attendance is mandatory – in accordance with university rules – students exceeding 3 absences (including illness or personal participation in program-related events scheduled during class) from class will not receive a grade for the course. When the course is offered on Zoom students will be required to attend the course online regularly – with no more than 3 absences while students will also be requested to utilize their cameras during class unless there are technical issues surrounding wifi – beyond their control.

Grade breakdown:

80% - Empirical or non-empirical paper, 20% reading reports.

For those not submitting a paper – reading reports will make up 80% of their grade and class participation will make up 20% of their grade.

Lecture Topics and Reading List

Meeting 1 Feb 20

Introduction: Diverse Representations of the Traumatic Pasts in Everyday Life

- **What is commemoration of the past? How for example is the Holocaust made present in everyday life? Can the topic of Genocide and Trauma be deconstructed despite its sanctity, and unspeakability?**
- **Diverse forms of Holocaust representation in everyday life: History, Witnessing, Testimony, photographic representation, Icons, Cinema, Ritual, Silence, Violence, Metaphor, Art, Literature, Revisionist performance.**
- **What is Anthropology's contribution to an understanding of Holocaust and Genocide and its aftermath? How might one create an Anthropology of the Holocaust and Genocide and what would its contribution be?**

Meeting 2 Feb 27

In search of Authentic Representation/Commemoration of the Past:

History vs. Memory

- **History – Positivist Legacy and the Limits of Holocaust Representation. Are all forms of presence legitimate? Are all forms of history authentic?**
- **Memory – Witnessing, Authenticity, Subjectivity, Authentic Reenactment vs. Distortion, Personal Lived Memory vs. Collectively constructed memory.**
- **The Transformation of Personal memory into Collective memory – history and historicity.**
- **History and the Representation of the Holocaust and Genocide**

Required Reading:

Friedlander, S. (1992) "Introduction" in *Probing the Limits of Representation*. Press. S. Friedlander (ed.) Cambridge: Harvard University Pp. 1-8

Schudson, M. (1997) "Dynamics of Distortion in Collective Memory" in *How Minds, Brains and Societies Reconstruct the Past*. D.L. Schacter (ed.) Pp. 346-351

Meeting 3 March 6

Transformation of Personal Memory into Collective Memory

Required Reading:

Nora, P. (1989) "Between Memory and History". *Representations* 26: 7-25. (7-16)

OR in Hebrew

נורה פ. (1993) בין זיכרון והיסטוריה: מחזות הזיכרון. *זמנים* 45: 19-5.

Halbwachs, M. (1980) *The Collective Memory*. New York: Harper Colphson Books. Pp. 68-87.

Friedlander, S. (1998) "The Shoa: Between Memory and History" in: *Breaking Crystal: Writing and Memory after Auschwitz*. E. Sicker, (ed.) Urbana: University of Illinois Press. Pp. 345-359.

Film: Night and Fog

Meeting 4/5 March 13 & March 20

**Saving Images of the Holocaust Past:
Photographs, images, documentary footage – the iconic presence of the past**

Required Reading:

Brink, C. (2000) "Looking at Photographs from Nazi Concentration Camps". *History and Memory* 1 2:135-150.

Zelizer, B. (1998) *Remembering to Forget: Holocaust Memory Through the Camera's Eye*. University of Chicago Press. Pp.-15-1

Recommended Reading:

Hirsch M. (2000) "Surviving Images: Holocaust Photographs and the Work of Post Memory" in B. Zelizer ed. London: Athlone Press. 215-246

Kleinman, Arthur and Kleinman, Joan. (1996). The Appeal of Experience; The Dismay of Images: Cultural Appropriations of Suffering in Our Times. *Daedalus*, Vol. 125, No. 1, Social Suffering (Winter, 1996), pp. 1-23

Meeting 6 March 27

Memory as Testimony

- Firsthand Witnessing: Survivorship, Authentic Witnessing, Testimony as Narrative

Required Reading:

Schudson, M. (1997) "Dynamics of Distortion in Collective Memory" in *Memory Distortion: How Minds, Brains and Societies Reconstruct the Past*. D.L. Schacter (ed.) Pp. 351-364.

Young J. E. (1990) *Writing and Rewriting the Holocaust: Narrative and the Consequence of Interpretation*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press. Pp. 1-25.

Levi, Primo (1986) *If this is a Man*. Summit Books.

לוי, פ. (1989) *האם זה אדם? תל אביב: עם עובד*.

Meeting 7 April 3

Memory as Testimony – Continued

Required Reading:

Langer, L. L. (1991) *Holocaust Testimonies: The Ruins of Memory*. New Haven: Yale University Press. Pp.38-1

or

Handelman, D. (1997) "Absence Rising: Telling Little Holocaust Stories in Israel". Unpublished Manuscript. Pp. 1-17

Film: Truth and Lies

Meeting 8 April 10

Second Hand Witnessing

- Transmitted Traumatic Legacies and the constitution of Witnesses once removed, second and third generation survivors, and vicarious witnessing
- Private-familial memory, mementos from the past and person-object interaction

Required Reading:

Kidron, Carol A. (2003) "Surviving the Distant Past: A Case Study of the Cultural Construction of Trauma Descendant Identity". *Ethos*, 31:513-544. (Hebrew Translation Available)

Berger, A.L. (1997) "Introduction" in *Children of Job: American Second-Generation Witnesses to the Holocaust*. Albany: State University of New York Press. Pp. 1-12.

Recommended Reading:

Kidron, Carol A. (2009) "Toward an Ethnography of Silence The Lived Presence of the Past among Holocaust Trauma Descendants in Israeli." *Current Anthropology* 50:1, 5-27.

Meeting 9 April 24

1. **Continuing Conversation on Second Generation Memory and Film – Because of that war.**
2. **Harnassing Memory: The Presence of the Holocaust as National, Political or Personal Symbolic Capital**
Constructing Collective Memory
 - **Nationalization and the Enlistment of Personal Memory and the Construction of Collective Memory, Ideological Framing of Collective Memory. Holocaust as National Mythic Narrative and Civil Religion**
 - **Memory as Symbolic Capital – the Politics of Memory**

Required Reading:

Yablonka, H. (1998) “The Formation of Holocaust Consciousness in the State of Israel: The Early Days”. in *Breaking Crystal: Writing and Memory after Auschwitz*. E. Sicker, (ed.) Urbana: University of Illinois Press. Pp. 119-136.

Zerubavel, Y.(1994) The Death of Memory and the Memory of Death: Masada and the Holocaust as Historical Metaphors” . *Representations* 45:72-100.

Schwartz, B. (1996) “Memory as Cultural System: Abraham Lincoln in World War II” *American Sociological Review*, 61:908-927.

Meeting 10/11 May 1 and May 8

Commemorative Rituals, Museums, Monuments, and Pilgrimages to the Past

- **Commemorative Rituals – Reenactment in the Service of the State**
- **Museums and Monuments – Institutionalizing and Grounding the Past in Space and Time**
- **Pilgrimages and Youth Trips - Reenacting Jewish/Israeli Key Scenarios**

Required Reading:

Friedlander, S. (1994) “Memory of the Shoah in Israel” in *The Art of Memory: Holocaust Memorials in History*. James Young ed. Prestel, Munich & New York: Prestel. Pp. 149-157

Young, J. E. (1990) When a Day Remembers: a Performative History of Yom Ha-Shoah. *History and Memory* 2:54-75.

Handelman, D. and Shamgar-Handelman, L. (1997) “The Presence of Absence: The Memorialism of National Death in Israel” In: E. Ben-Ari and Y. Bilu eds. *Grasping*

the Land: Space and Place in Contemporary Israeli Discourse and Experience. New York: State University of New York Press. Pp. 85-128.

Recommended Reading:

Azoulay, A. (1993) "With Open Doors: Museums of History in the Israeli Public Space." *Theory and Criticism* 4: 79-95. (Available in Hebrew)

Feldman, J. 2002. Marking the boundaries of the enclave: Defining the Israeli collective through the Poland 'experience'. *Israel Studies* 7: 85-114.

Handelman, D. (1990) *Models and Mirrors - Towards an Anthropology of Public Events*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. Pp.202-233.

Young J. E. (1988) *Writing and Rewriting the Holocaust: Narrative and the Consequence of Interpretation*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press. Pp. 172-189.

Film: Yizkor: Slaves to Memory

Meeting 12/13 May 15 and May 22

A. Rewriting Memory or Representing the Presence of Lost Memory

- Narratives, Scenarios, and Changing Images – Holocaust Representation as a Prism of Changes in Israeli Society
- From Silence and Univocal Nationalism to Empathy and Multivocality – from "Shoa and Redemption/Heroism, and Sheep to the Slaughter to the "Heroism of Perseverance"

Revisionist Presence: Resisting and Challenging the Myth

- **The Emergence of Personal Voice**
- **Alternative Holocaust Ceremonies**
- **Holocaust Representation on Digital Media**
- **Shoa Business: Banalization of the Holocaust**
- **Holocaust Humor: Bad Taste or Resisting the limits of Representation**

Required Reading:

Frosh, P. and A. Pinchevski. 2014. Media Witnessing and the Ripeness of Time. *Critical Inquiry* 28 (4): 594-610.

Recommended Reading:

זרטל, ע. (2002) *אומה והמוות*. תל-אביב: דביר. 225-284.

Linn, R. (1996) "Conscience in War: The Israeli Soldier as a Moral Critique" in *Criticism and Culture From Collective Memory to Voice*. Albany: SUNY Press. Pp. 137-165.

Lentin, R. (2000) Introduction. In *Israel and the Daughters of the Shoa: Re-occupying the Territories of Silence*. New York: Berghahn Books.

Meeting 14 May 29

The Limits of Representation Revisited

- **Losing the Monopoly on Suffering and Victimhood – The concept of Genocide, Politics of Victimhood and Humanitarian Intervention**
- **Limited Presence or the Limits of Construction**
- **Temporality or the Framers as Limiting Presence**
- **Holocaust as Metaphor for Human Suffering – Universalizing the Holocaust**

Required Reading:

Levy, D. and N. Sznajder. 2002. Memory Unbound: The Holocaust Formation of Cosmopolitan Memory. *European Journal of Social Theory*. 5: 87-105.

Bauman, Z. (1998) 'Hereditary victimhood: the Holocaust's life as a ghost. *Tikkun*, 13: 33-38.

Recommended Reading:

Zerubavel, Y. (1995) "Conclusion" in *Recovered Roots: Collective Memory and the Making of National Tradition*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press. Pp. 214-237.

Feldman, Y. (1998) Whose Story Is It Anyway? Ideology and Psychology in the Representations of the Shoa in Israeli Literature" in *Probing the Limits of Representation*. Press. S. Friedlander (ed.) Cambridge: Harvard University Pp. 223-239

Appendix

Case Studies of Genocide and Commemoration of Traumatic Pasts – for empirical papers:

- **Memory and commemoration of Wars in Israel**
- **Bereavement in Israel**
- **Rabin Assassination**
- **Palestinian private and public memory and emergent forms of commemoration**
- **Roma Genocide**
- **Armenian Genocide**
- **Hiroshima and Nagasaki as Contested Memory**
- **Cambodia – Auto Genocide**
- **Remembering and Forgetting in Argentina**
- **Vietnam – from Forgetting to Multi-vocal Memory**
- **Globalization of Trauma: Humanitarian Global Intervention and the constitution of Truth Tribunals**

Reading List for Empirical papers:

Hinton, A.L. 1998. A Head for an Eye: Revenge in the Cambodian Genocide. *American Ethnologist* 25: 352-377.

<http://www.jstor.org/stable/645789>

Hughes, R. (2003) "Nationalism and Genocide at the Tuol Sleng Museum of Genocide Crimes." *In Contested Pasts: The Politics of Memory*. Katherine Hodgkin and Susanna Radstone, eds. Pp. 175-207. New York: Routledge.

Hayden, R.M. (2007) "Moral vision and impaired insight." *Current Anthropology* 48:105-131. (Genocide and Western Intervention in the Balkans)

Jackson, Michael (2004) "The Prose of Suffering and the Practice of Silence." *Spiritus* 4: 44-59. (Genocide in Sierra Leone)

Khalili, Laleh (2004) "Grass-roots Commemoration: Remembering the Land in the Camps of Lebanon." *Journal of Palestine Studies* 34: 6-22.

Zolberg, V.L. 1998. Contested Remembrance: The Hiroshima Exhibit Controversy. *Theory and Society* 27:565-590.

Di Paolantonio, M. 2000. Loss in Present Terms: Reading the Limits of Post-Dictatorship Argentina's National Conciliation In *Between Hope and Despair: Pedagogy and the Remembrance of Historical Trauma*. R. I. Simon, S. Rosenberg & C. Eppert, Eds. Lanham: Rowman and Littlefield. 153-186.

Wagner-Pacifici, R. and Schwartz, B. 1991. The Vietnam Veterans Memorial:

Commemorating a Difficult Past. *American Journal of Sociology* 97:376.

Vinitzky Seroussi, V. 2001 Commemorating a Difficult Past: The Yitzhak Rabin Memorial Day in Israeli Schools. *Qualitative Sociology* 24: 245-268
<http://www.springerlink.com/content/w701544653780507/>

Wilson, R. 2001. Introduction: Human Rights and Nation Building. *In* *The Politics of Truth and Reconciliation in South Africa*. Pp. 1-32.

Auron. Y. 2005 *The Banality of Denial: Israel and the Armenian Genocide*.